

## ABERDEEN CITY COUNCIL

---

<b>COMMITTEE</b>	City Growth & Resources
<b>DATE</b>	25th August 2021
<b>EXEMPT</b>	No
<b>CONFIDENTIAL</b>	No
<b>REPORT TITLE</b>	Denis Law Projects Update
<b>REPORT NUMBER</b>	COM/21/175
<b>DIRECTOR</b>	Gale Beattie
<b>CHIEF OFFICER</b>	Richard Sweetnam
<b>REPORT AUTHOR</b>	David Officer
<b>TERMS OF REFERENCE</b>	3.2

---

### 1. PURPOSE OF REPORT

- 1.1 This report provides the feasibility outcomes and recommendations for the Printfield 10 mural project.

### 2. RECOMMENDATION(S)

The Committee:-

- 2.1 Notes the creativity and work that has gone into developing the Printfield 10 project proposals to date;
- 2.2 Notes the significant costs in delivering and maintaining the proposed murals as well as the Council staff resources which would be required to complete the project;
- 2.3 Agrees that the murals are not a feasible part of the Printfield 10 project due to the costs and challenges associated with them; and
- 2.4 Instruct the Chief Officer – City Growth to provide the Denis Law Legacy Trust with appropriate support to identify potential funding avenues to realise the walking trail proposal.

### 3. BACKGROUND

- 3.1 On the 3rd of March 2020, the Council resolved to welcome the Printfield Community Forum working in partnership with the Denis Law Legacy Trust to promote Denis Law's childhood roots in Printfield and instructed the Chief Officer – City Growth to discuss with the Denis Law Legacy Trust the proposed Printfield 10 Project to include public artwork and report back, if applicable to the City Growth and Resources Committee for its consideration.

- 3.2 The Denis Law Legacy Trust has developed the Printfield 10 Project with the aim of motivating, inspiring, and engaging the Printfield community, whilst also celebrating Denis Law who is the only Scottish footballer to win the Ballon D'or.
- 3.3 At the May meeting of the City Growth and Resources Committee asked Officers to work with the trust and produce a report detailing the full costs, timeline and feasibility of the three murals originally proposed as part of the Printfield 10 Project.
- 3.4 The report produced by officers in May set an indicative cost of £105,000 for the delivery of the three proposed murals but did not define any costs associated with the mural being produced at the proposed site including, preparation work, ongoing maintenance, consultation, building surveys, image licensing and other incidentals.
- 3.5 The murals form part of a wider project which includes a walking trail featuring further images of Denis Law linked to key moments of his career and football skills challenges for participants to complete. This element of the project has not been brought before the Committee for a decision at this stage as it was believed to form phase 2 of the project.
- 3.6 While the proposal has been developed by the Denis Law Legacy Trust, the original concept came from the Printfield Community Council, however neither group has indicated they would wish to take on a management role for the delivery of the project at this point.

### **Project Feasibility**

- 3.7 Officers were instructed to report on the feasibility of the murals as proposed by the Denis Law Legacy Trust. Key questions were:
- Are the walls suitable for a large-scale mural piece?
  - Are permissions in place for the use of images and for the sited walls?
  - What are the anticipated costs for future maintenance of the murals?
  - How much would it cost to restore the walls at a later date?
  - Who would deliver the project and take on full project management responsibility and assurances?
  - Are there any additional costs related to research and delivery not covered in the May report?
- 3.8 Officers attempted to arrange a meeting with St Joseph's Church to discuss the project but have had no response to the proposal and are unable to secure their permission and commitment to the project at this stage.,
- 3.9 In discussion with the Denis Law Legacy Trust, they confirmed they are not aware of holding any permissions for the images proposed and it is not clear who currently holds the copyright for these photographs.
- 3.10 As the Council is the property owner of the two Tower Blocks, permission to place the murals on Clifton Court would be relatively straight forward process to secure, however it is best practice in these circumstances to engage and

secure the consent of residents and a full consultation would be recommended prior to commencing work. Based on average planning consultation process this is estimated to take up to 6 months to complete and at a cost of approx. £4,000.

3.11 The previous report suggested the 3 murals could be delivered at a cost of **£105,000**. This was an estimate based on discussions with Aberdeen Inspired and a commercial mural company both with significant experience in delivering this type of project. However, further investigation indicates the full cost would be greater given the challenges in painting residential tower blocks safely. It should be noted most commercial murals have a set life span to tie in with a campaign or in the case of street art festivals they are temporary rather than permanent installations. In addition, this cost excluded site preparation which could include cleaning and painting the proposed wall on each tower block. This could have a substantial additional cost up to **£50,000** per wall in-line with the costs received for removing the murals in the future.

3.12 Once the murals fade over time, the Council will be faced with a number of options:

1. Take no further actions and leave the murals to fade and weather;
2. Repaint the murals; and
3. Paint over the murals.

**Option 1** has no cost associated but is likely to generate negative opinion from residents and visitors alike.

**Option 2** would require the contracting of a mural company following a similar process taken to deliver the original work and given the size and scale of the murals is likely to incur similar costs of around **£100,000**.

Following consultation with the Council's Quantity Surveyor **Option 3** is also likely to cost around **£100,000** to repaint the murals given the size of the wall and the equipment required to complete the job safely.

3.13 In discussions with the Denis Law Legacy Trust they have indicated that they would be seeking The Council to take on the full role of project delivery to realise the proposal. However, due to the scale of the proposal and level of resources required to manage and deliver the project at a time when resources are committed to the City's recovery from the Covid-19 pandemic, it would be officer's opinion there is no additional capacity within the services to take the project forward at this time. Officers recommendation is that if the Denis Law Legacy Trust and the Printfield Community Project wish to continue developing this project that they look to manage and deliver it via a contracted third party.

3.14 The proposal thus far has been developed primarily as a concept with limited supporting evidence of wider consultation, feasibility research or costings. If the project is to be developed further, it would require a building survey of the two tower blocks to ensure they are suitable for murals as well as a full consultation with the residents. This is anticipated to cost around **£8,000**. In addition, a cost/benefit analysis, fundraising plan and full budget should be produced by

the partners developing the Printfield 10 project alongside other research showing a community need for this work.

- 3.15 No fundraising has been undertaken to support the Printfield 10 project, either for the murals or the wider project. In discussion with the Denis Law Legacy Trust it would appear the expectation is The Council would provide full funding as well as project management.

### **Feasibility Summary**

- 3.16 For the reasons outlined above including significant associated costs, specific challenges on permissions, limited evidence of community need and cost benefit as well as the Council's own limited resources to manage and finance the project at present, it would be officer's recommendation that the Mural project is not feasible, and no further resource should be allocated to its development at this time.
- 3.17 Officers have had a more positive discussion with the Trust in respect to the walking trail included in the Printfield 10 project (Appendix 1). This project is more modest and could be delivered by the Printfield Community Project in partnership with the Denis Law Legacy Trust. This project would be suitable for a number of funds open to applications and Officers can advise the Denis Law Legacy Trust on how to apply and work that is needed prior to doing so.
- 3.18 It should also be noted that the legacy of Denis Law is already well represented and celebrated within Aberdeen. His achievements have been recognised through the Freedom of the City, two statues, one of which officers are working with the Denis Law Legacy Trust to display prominently in the city centre, an all-weather football pitch named after him as well as delivering the successful Streetsport initiative with Robert Gordon University.

## **4. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS**

- 4.1 Should the mural part of the Printfield 10 project continue to be progressed an application would need to be made to the Common Good Fund for the delivery costs which are likely to be in excess of **£100,000**. These applications are normally referred to the budget setting process, with the next Council Budget meeting due to be held in March 2022.
- 4.2 Site preparation is likely to cost up to **£50,000** for each tower block wall, in-line with the costs received for painting over or maintaining the murals in future.
- 4.3 It is highly likely that maintenance and/or removal of the murals would be the responsibility of the Council as building owners and both options would cost a further **£100,000** to undertake.
- 4.4 As the Denis Law Legacy Trust and the Printfield Community Project have no funds allocated to this project, any research and consultation which forms part of the preparation for delivery would have to be paid from Council budgets at this stage. This is likely to be around **£8,000**.

4.5 In the projects current form, delivery of the murals would fall to Council officers and a project of this scale would require significant capacity to manage. It is likely to fall to an officer at G13 or G14 level incurring the associated staffing costs with this. In preparing and selecting a tender, managing delivery and producing associated reports, officers may spend around 240 hours on this project resulting in a projected staff cost of **£4,874** for a G14 post on the 1<sup>st</sup> point of the salary scale.

## 5. LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

5.1 Should the mural project continue as proposed, there would be a legal requirement to obtain image licences for the photographs of Denis Law which the murals are based on. These would also be necessary to obtain for the proposed walking trail. The Denis Law Legacy Trust has confirmed they would procure the appropriate licences.

## 6. MANAGEMENT OF RISK

Category	Risk	Low (L) Medium (M) High (H)	Mitigation
<b>Strategic Risk</b>	None identified	n/a	n/a
<b>Compliance</b>	None identified	n/a	n/a
<b>Operational</b>	None Identified	n/a	n/a
<b>Financial</b>	<u>None Identified</u>	n/a	n/a
<b>Reputational</b>	Community disappointment with project not proceeding.	L	Council has demonstrated significant support to Denis Law's legacy, including commitment to the Denis Law Statue. Report recommends Denis Law Trust and Printfield Community are signposted to other appropriate funding to take forward walking trail.
<b>Environment / Climate</b>	None identified	n/a	n/a

## 7. OUTCOMES

<b><u>COUNCIL DELIVERY PLAN</u></b>	
	<b>Impact of Report</b>
<b>Aberdeen City Council Policy Statement</b>	<i>The recommendations in this report do not adversely impact the delivery of the policy statement and will ensure officers continue to have capacity to focus on delivery of key projects in this area.</i>

<b>Aberdeen City Local Outcome Improvement Plan</b>	
Prosperous Economy Stretch Outcomes	<i>The project would have had minimal impact on the stretch outcomes and the recommendations will have no negative impact</i>
Prosperous People Stretch Outcomes	<i>The project would have had minimal impact on the stretch outcomes and the recommendations will have no negative impact</i>
Prosperous Place Stretch Outcomes	<i>The project would have had minimal impact on the stretch outcomes and the recommendations will have no negative impact</i>
<b>Regional and City Strategies</b>	<b><i>The project would not have contributed to the delivery of regional and city strategies; thus the recommendations have no negative impact on these.</i></b>
<b>UK and Scottish Legislative and Policy Programmes</b>	<b><i>No impact identified</i></b>

## 8. IMPACT ASSESSMENTS

Assessment	Outcome
Impact Assessment	not required
Data Protection Impact Assessment	not required

## 9. BACKGROUND PAPERS

Printfield 10 Project and Denis Law Statue Relocation – City Growth and Resources Committee 11<sup>th</sup> May 2021

## 10. APPENDICES

Appendix 1 – Printfield Project V3

## 11. REPORT AUTHOR CONTACT DETAILS

<b>Name</b>	David Officer
<b>Title</b>	Cultural Planning Officer
<b>Email Address</b>	<a href="mailto:davofficer@aberdeencity.gov.uk">davofficer@aberdeencity.gov.uk</a>
<b>Tel</b>	01224 346145